This study examines the faith development and civic engagement of alumni of three secondary independent Christian schools to understand the role Christian education plays in developing one’s faith and how both faith development and education impact the ways in which one engages in a pluralist society. It was conducted in Northeast Ohio, and examined how alumni from three evangelical Christian secondary schools viewed their educational experience as it relates to the school’s efforts to shape them as Christian citizens in a religiously pluralistic society and how those experiences impact how they engage with a secular world once they leave the secondary school environment. A narrative study was conducted with 11 alumni and 2 were staff members of the schools. An analysis of the data found that the school had both positive and negative impacts on how students chose to engage with society. For many of the students their time in the schools negatively impacted how they engaged and limited the types of environments in which they could engage. However, these same students grew in their faith while in the school which prompted them to find ways to engage with the community as adults. This study provides insight for Christian educators on the role both the curricular and co-curricular activities play in the way students engage a pluralist society upon graduation.